

# The Key Players In The Transitional Justice In Marawi Siege Post-Conflict In Marawi City, Lanao Del Sur

**Raima S. Dimaampao**

Mindanao State University (MSU), Marawi, City, Lanao del Sur, 9700, Philippines

## ABSTRACT

The study aimed to describe the transitional justice mechanisms and their implementation in the Marawi Siege Post-Conflict. It used mixed methods of quantitative and qualitative. The respondents of the study were the internally displaced persons (IDPs) and key players in the post-Marawi Siege conflict. Descriptive statistics and Spearman's Rho correlation coefficient were used as statistical tools to analyze data in this study. The study found that the majority of the respondents are middle-aged adults with a substantial proportion of the respondents being female, married with educational attainment; however, the majority of the respondents are unemployed and jobless. They belong to low-income to poor socioeconomic classes with an average monthly income of Php 4,500. The respondents are from the 24 barangays, also called Ground Zero of Marawi City. Basic rights to get their way of life and livelihood are an injustice experienced by the IDPs, which the majority of the respondents agreed. Looting is another form of human rights violation experienced. In terms of legitimate grievances, they deem the failure of the government to support the socio-economic development of IDPs. Prostitution and other illegal trade of business is, unaddressed issue of the IDPs.

**Keywords:** Transitional Justice; Post-conflict; Marawi Siege; Internally Displaced Persons; Sustainable Peace.

## 1. Introduction

### 1.1. Background of the Study

Transitional Justice (TJ) was defined as referring to the full range of processes and mechanisms associated with a society's attempt to come to terms with a legacy of large-scale past abuses, to ensure accountability, serve justice, and achieve reconciliation". (United Nations, 2010). TJ embodies an attempt to build sustainable peace after conflict, mass violence, or systemic human rights abuse. (Zyl, 2005). In the Sustainable Development Goal 2030, the importance of transitional justice is recognized in the global goal number sixteen (16) which promotes the rule of law at the national and international levels and ensures access to justice. (United Nations, United Nations General Assembly. Transforming our world: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Preamble, 2015) Anne MacDonald (2017) argues that TJ is an overburdened and under-conceptualized idea, stated in her article on Local Understanding and experiences of transitional justice in 2013. This shows that transitional justice literature has limited study. TJ is an established field, but it is also new and still evolving. (Brankovic, 2014) In the Philippine context, transitional justice is linked to the Presidential Commission on Good Governance (PCHR) as a TJ

mechanism. It was created to investigate abuses committed in the year 1972 to 1986. (Research Study on Community Narratives of Resilience and Truth Seeking, 2019) Furthermore, TJ in the Philippines is also associated with the Human Rights Victims Reparations and Recognition Act (RA 10368), which provided compensation and the creation of the Human Rights Victims Compensation Board (HRVCB) for human rights abuses under the Marcos regime. (Carranza, 2014). In Mindanao, TJ is linked to the Comprehensive Agreement in the Bangsamoro (CAB), which was signed in 2014 at Malacañang. It concludes the seventeen (17) years of negotiations between the Government of the Philippines (GPH) and Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF) (Timeline of the Bangsamoro Peace Process and CSO Engagements of the Bangsamoro Organic Law, 2020). It was a long struggle for the independence of Southern Philippines from the year 1968, from the Jabidah massacre in Corregidor Island and subsequent massacres such as Manili in Carmen, and the Tacub massacre in Kauswagan happened. There was a Peace negotiation that started in 1997 between the MNLF and the GPH after signing the Final Peace Agreement. As a result, in the year 1996, autonomous regions in Cordilleras and Mindanao were established. However, in 2000 there was a declaration of "all-out war" against MILF by former President Joseph Estrada. Hostilities between the government and MILF broke out in Central Mindanao. In 2001, former President Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo resumed the peace talks. But in 2008, the Memorandum of Agreement on Ancestral Domain (MOA-AD) was declared unconstitutional by the Supreme Court, and thus, hostilities in Central Mindanao resumed. Based on the timeline of the armed conflicts and peace negotiations between the Government of the Philippines and the Moro Liberation Front, it was in 2012, after a series of peace talks, that the Transition Commission was created to craft the Bangsamoro Basic Law (BBL). The Comprehensive Agreement on the Bangsamoro (CAB) is a peace agreement containing provisions on transitional justice seeking to ensure that the transition to peace will be just and enduring. CAB was expected to provide the basis for the exercise of political authority, advance a chance to end violence, uphold the Bangsamoro basic right to self-governance and self-management of Bangsamoro patrimony, and lastly to open the possibility towards reconciliation and the correction of historical injustices against the Bangsamoro (Initiative for International Dialogue, 2020). The noteworthy feature of the agreement is the inclusion of provisions on transitional justice, which emphasized the importance of dealing with the past (A Duterte Reader: Critical Essay on Rodrigo's Early Presidency, 2018). The CAB includes two tracks for the peace process: the political track, which comprises the setting up of the autonomous government, and the so-called normalization process, which consists of a combination of measures related to decommissioning of former combatants, the establishment of the transitional justice process, and the implementation of confidence-building initiatives. (TJRC Report, 2016). The Annex on Normalization dated January 25, 2014, provided for a Transitional Justice and Reconciliation Commission (TJRC). It is tasked to work on the programs for transitional justice to address the legitimate grievances of the Bangsamoro people, correct historical injustices, and address human rights violations. As of 2020, the 12-point agenda of the BARMM published by the Bangsamoro Planning and Development Authority (BPDA) has special programs for transitioning combatants and support for the ongoing Marawi rehabilitation as part of the transitional justice published on the official website of the Bangsamoro government (<https://bangsamoro.gov.ph>). The Marawi Siege on May 23, 2017, lasted five months and claimed the lives of 920 militants, 165 soldiers, and 47 civilians, and forcibly displaced 360,000 people (htt2). In June 2017, the Inter-Agency Task Force for the Recovery, Reconstruction, and Rehabilitation of Marawi City, also known as Task Force Bangon Marawi (TFBM), was created. In the context of Marawi City and Lanao del Sur, this study examined transitional justice in the post-Marawi Siege conflict. The Marawi City recovery and rehabilitation after

the siege spearheaded by the TFBM used a master plan to rehabilitate and rebuild the city. Thus, planning is not just for development and maintaining security, according to Maglana (2018), it also needs to reflect on how transitional justice was systematically addressed. This study describes transitional justice in the context of post-conflict in Marawi.

## **2. Literature Review**

### **1. Marawi-Siege**

Marawi is the capital city of the province of Lanao del Sur on the island of Mindanao in the southern Philippines. During the Marawi Siege in 2017, there were 29 barangays with a total estimated 2017 population of 74,359 that were within the battle area. The main battle area of the conflict covers 4 square kilometers. The Marawi crisis has resulted in the damage of over 95% of the structures in the main battle area, or 5,2170 structures. Of those affected, 2125 structures were destroyed or uninhabitable; 913 structures are heavily damaged, 913 structures are heavily damaged, and 1232 buildings are partially damaged (Malicdem, 2017). The city was declared liberated on October 17, 2017, as two of the Maute group's leaders were killed the day before the president announced the liberation (Bueza, 2017). Five billion pesos were allotted for the rehabilitation of the city, which includes the construction of transitional homes for the evacuees. (Sarmiento, 2017). According to Kristoffer Purisima, the Assistant Secretary of Civil Defense, the barangays have accessible water, electricity, and health services. The government gave financial and other assistance, Such as relief goods good for 17 days, kitchen kits, etc were given to the returnees (Panti, L.6400 evacuees return to war-torn Marawi 2017 Retrieved from <http://www.manilatimes.net/6400-evacuees-return-war-torn-marawi/360578/>.) To ensure the security of the city, the government has created a curfew. The curfew was designed to secure the vicinity and is not a measure to lessen the movement of the people who were able to return to barangays. Furthermore, it is to avoid the entry of the Maute group sympathizers in Marawi City. Checkpoints have also been set up to further their security measures. (Reyes, 2017)

### **2. Understanding Transitional Justice**

The trials of Nazi perpetrators in the Nuremberg event started the discipline of transitional justice. (Teitel 2000). Transitional Justice (TJ) is defined as a field and practice that emerged in the late 1980s with efforts to facilitate the transitions from authoritarian to democratic regimes to address the violations committed by the outgoing dictatorship. (Brankovic, 2014). Human Rights serve as one of the conceptual foundations of transitional justice. Another definition of Transitional Justice is “formal and informal procedures implemented by a group or institution of accepted legitimacy around the time of transition out of an oppressive or violent social order, for rendering justice to perpetrators, and their collaborators, as well as victims” (Kaminski, 2006). It is also defined as a “set of practices, mechanisms, and concerns that arise following a period of conflict, civil strife, or repression, and that are aimed directly at confronting and dealing with past violations of human rights and humanitarian law. (Arriaza, 2006). The UN Commitment to transitional Justice was first outlined by UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan in 2004 and defined as a “full range of processes and mechanisms associated with a society’s attempt to come to terms with a legacy of large scale past abuses, to ensure accountability, serve justice and achieve reconciliation. (United Nations, Guidance Note of the Secretary-General: United Nations Approach to Transitional Justice, 2010). These may include both judicial and non-judicial mechanisms, with differing levels of international involvement (or none) and individual prosecutions, reparations, truth-seeking, institutional reforms, vetting, and dismissals or a combined thereof”. Thus, transitional justice becomes a key component in the

UN framework for strengthening of Rule of Law in post-conflict areas and the transition phases. (United Nations, Guidance Note of the Secretary-General: United Nations Approach to Transitional Justice, 2010). Moreover, addressing the past in transitions from conflict or repressive rule encompasses different mechanisms or approaches such as criminal prosecutions, truth-seeking, reparations, and reform of law and institutions. TJ is a relatively new field at the early stage of theory-building. (Duggan, 2010)

### **3. Transitional Justice in the International Context**

Many international organizations such as the UN, later the EU, the Organization from the American States (OAS), the African Union, and the World Bank published a report in 2011 the First World Development Report on Conflict, Security, and Development, which included a clear link between transitional justice and societal democratic development. (Greiff, 2010) In this light, many countries have employed mechanisms to operationalize TJ as a State obligation to address historical injustices in the forms of the establishment of truth commissions, reparations, and institutional reforms. International Criminal Justice is one of the “few major achievements for the world community we may observe in the last 20 years” (Cassese, 2011). Guatemala is a society traumatized by violence and impunity. After 36 years of armed conflict in Guatemala, peace accords were signed in 1996. Peace Accords are essential in the promotion of reconciliation. Transitional justice in Guatemala supports the Roman Catholic Church Project to document human rights violations and to the UN Truth and Reconciliation Commission and the government human rights institution and peace secretariat. Guatemala supported the United Nations Development Program (UNDP)'s transitional justice program which includes support for civil society efforts to document human rights violations through interview and forensic anthropology, empowerment of victims, and the historical police archives. East Timor is also one of the countries which suffered massive human rights abuses in their lives under Indonesian occupation from 1976 to 1999 and are believed to have lost lives during the 24 years. (The Report of the Commission for Reception, Truth, and Reconciliation: Timor Leste: Executive Summary, 2005). East Timor is situated around 500km north of Darwin, Australia, and shares the island of Timor with the Indonesian West Timor to its left. It came under interest from both Dutch and Portuguese colonial aspirations from the 16<sup>th</sup> century, but it was the Portuguese who in the end managed to best control. In the year 1975, Indonesia intervened and launched a full-scale invasion. It was brutal with numerous instances of indiscriminate execution and mass killings, rape, and property destruction. (Dunn, East Timor). The unlawful invasion and brutal occupation of East Timor by Indonesia were acknowledged by the international community. The Dili Massacre, also referred to as Sta. Cruz Massacre in 1991, when the Indonesian military cracked down mercilessly on East Timorese who were attending a pro-independence march, was broadcast internationally and opened the world's eyes to the Indonesian repression. A multinational intervention managed to quell the violence, and the United Nations temporarily took over the administration of the territory. INTERPRET, an UN-authorized multinational force allowed to intervene to restore peace and security. (East Timor and New Humanitarian Interventionism, International Affairs 77, 2001). INTERPRET was replaced by the United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor (UNTAET) in February 2000. UNTAET was given the challenging task to govern, rebuild and prepare the East Timorese society for independence. (The United Nations, Security Council Resolution 1272, December 1999). In May 2002, East Timor joined the world society as an independent nation. This happened when the authority over East Timor was formally transferred from United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor (UNTAET) to the first elected East Timorese government. Since independence, East Timor has managed to establish what must be termed a good functioning relationship with Indonesia two states have come to respect each other's

territorial integrity. In the former Yugoslavia, there was also a wide scale of atrocities that breached international humanitarian law and escalated to war crimes, crimes against humanity, and genocide during the war. (Prosecutor v. Krstic Case No. IT-98-33, Appeals Chamber Judgement, para 39. , April 2004). This led to the formation of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia. It was created to prosecute the four clusters of offenses: grave breaches of the 1949 Geneva Conventions, violations of the laws and customs of war, genocide, and crimes against humanity. the international community has pursued prosecutions through ad-hoc international criminal tribunals, hybrid domestic/international courts, and the permanent ICC (Schiff, 2008). More specifically, the international community established two international ad-hoc criminal tribunals with the assignment to investigate war crimes and prosecute perpetrators. (Rudolph). Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court and International Criminal Court was established. In the African conflict situation in 2008, there were different but interrelated approaches to conflict resolution in Africa in different conflict situations. Military Intervention has been one of the most frequently used strategies. The African Union and the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) have played critical roles in resolving Africa's conflicts. Oluwadare (2015) noted that military interventions have been employed by both the AU and ECOWAS as a major mechanism to restore calm and create the environment for further tools of transitional justice processes and mechanisms to be used. These interventions have been aimed largely at protecting civilian populations, restoring democratic government, and keeping the peace as a prelude to the implementation of other conflict resolution and peacebuilding mechanisms.

#### **4. Transitional Justice in the Philippines**

In the Philippines, the transitional justice, and reconciliation commission (TJRC) was created by the peace negotiating panels to study and make recommendations on appropriate actions and mechanisms to address legitimate grievances, historical injustices, and human rights violations suffered by the Bangsamoro people for the longest armed conflict between the uprising groups of the Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF). They completed the TJRC report in March 2016 with 90 recommendations. The main recommendation is the creation of the National Transitional Justice and Reconciliation Commission of the Bangsamoro (NTJRCB) for the overall implementation of the report's proposed action. An agreement between the Philippine Government and the Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF) called the Comprehensive Agreement on the Bangsamoro (CAB) was signed in 2014. After 17 years of difficult peace negotiations, it took five more years after the CAB was signed for a plebiscite and law to be passed to establish BARMM in March 2019. The CAB includes two tracks for the peace process: the political track, which comprises the setting up of the autonomous government, and the so-called normalization process, which consists of a combination of measures related to decommissioning of former combatants, the establishment of the transitional justice process, and the implementation of confidence-building initiatives. The guidance on transitional justice was integrated in the 2019 Executive Order (EO) 79 on Implementing the Annex on Normalization under the CAB as one of the annexes of Normalization, the Inter-Cabinet Mechanism has a transitional justice sub0cluster formulating a roadmap to be presented to the Government peace implementing panel. Each of the Government and MILF peace of the implementing panels has their technical writing group that would eventually jointly evolve a road map on transitional justice. (Veneracion-Rallonza, M. Evolving transitional justice in the Bangsamoro. March 2020) .Inter-Cabinet Cluster Mechanism on Normalization (ICCMN) is a multi-agency body tasked to consolidate and integrate the interventions of the national government in line with the Normalization Phase, particularly those focused on the decommissioning of Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF) combatants and their



weapons, and the transformation of their camps into peaceful, resilient, and progressive communities. Under EO 79 or the Annex on Normalization, the ICCMN's membership includes the Department of Defense, Interior, Justice, Social Welfare and Development, Agriculture, Education, Finance, Health, Labor, Budget, Trade, Information, and Communication as the TESDA, NEDA, NSC, NCIP, and CHED. An Act Establishing a Transitional Justice and Reconciliation Program for the Bangsamoro, Creating for the Purpose the National Transition Justice and Reconciliation Commission for the Bangsamoro and Appropriating Funds Thereof (formerly House Bill 5669) in the 18<sup>th</sup> Congress. Bangsamoro Human Rights Commission (BHRC) newly created through the Bangsamoro Autonomy Act No 4 was mandated to take on human rights TJ initiatives in the interim. (In the absence of a regional commission in BARMM). The BHRC according to Art IX, Sec 52, The BHRC shall perform the human rights component of the TJ mechanism until such time that a Bangsamoro Transition Justice Commission has been created. The BHRC shall document and investigate human rights violations; collect testimonial, object, or documentary evidence; provide information, data, and documents in relation thereto; provide research and technical support and promote the transitional justice mechanisms.

### **3. Research Methodology**

#### **3.1. Research Design**

The study used mixed methods that utilized the method of quantitative and qualitative modes of data. Qualitative research is a type of social science research that relies on non-numerical data, often in textual form (Saunders et. al, 2009). The qualitative approach will use interviews and focus group discussions to describe the transitional justice mechanisms, challenges encountered, and recommendations in implementing transitional justice towards sustainable peace in Lanao del Sur. The qualitative approach will use a survey questionnaire to profile key players of the post-Marawi Siege conflict and identify the activities, projects, programs, and policies on transitional justice.

#### **3.2. Research Setting**

This study was conducted in Marawi City. Marawi, known as *Dansalan*, is a component city in the coastal province of [Lanao del Sur](#). It is the provincial capital of the province of Lanao del Sur. It has a land area of 87.55 square kilometers or 33.80 square miles, which constitutes 0.58% of Lanao del Sur's total area. Its population based on the 2020 Census was 207,010, which represented 17.32% of the total population of the province or 4.70% of the overall population of the [Bangsamoro Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao](#). In the website [www.icrc.org](http://www.icrc.org) article on the Marawi dated 2018, there were reports from 100,000 civilians displaced by the five-month conflict in 2017 in Marawi City. They are still unable to return because of the extent of the damage and are still in temporary shelters or living with relatives elsewhere.

#### **3.3. Data Gathering Procedure**

In the conduct of the study, the researcher used the research instruments of the study such as the survey questionnaire, interview guide, and focus group discussion (FGD) guide. The research instruments were translated into the Meranaw language. A pre-test of the research instruments was conducted on selected informants to test their validity and reliability. Comments from the selected informants were gathered and integrated into the research instrument for improvement and enhancement. The researcher identifies a research assistant in each area and conducted proper orientation in using the research instruments and the support needed to conduct the data-gathering procedures. Research assistants helped in the distribution and retrieval of a survey questionnaire. Together with the research assistant, the researcher conducted interviews and focus group discussions with the appointed and elected area leaders of Sagonsongan

Temporary Shelter and Boganga Shelter in Marawi City and key persons in the implementation of the Marawi Recovery and Rehabilitation.

### **3.3. Research Instruments**

This study used mixed methods of survey, focus group discussion, and interview to gather data. It makes use of a survey questionnaire, interview guide, and focus group discussion (FGD) guide as research instruments. To obtain information on the challenges and recommendations of the respondents toward sustainable peace in Lanao del Sur, an interview was conducted using an interview guide. The interview guide was written in English and translated into Meranaw. A survey questionnaire was used to describe the profile of the key players in transitional justice of the post-Marawi Siege conflict and gather perceptions and responses of the respondents on transitional justice in the post-Marawi Siege conflict. The questionnaire was divided into four parts. The first part is on the profile of the respondents which contains their basic information including /her age, sex, civil status, if a married number of children, the total number of households, occupation, the major source of income, monthly income, present address, and address in MAA in Marawi City. The second part is on identifying the scope of TJ in the post-Marawi Siege. The third is the discussion on their challenges and factors affecting the implementation of programs on transitional justice. The last part is on the recommendations of the respondents in promoting reconciliation and healing, and programs, projects, policies, and activities in the implementation of transitional justice toward sustainable peace in Lanao del Sur. An interview guide was used among the selected key informants of the study. Interview guide is divided into four parts as well; the first part is on the basic profile of respondents such as sex, age, educational attainment, address on the ground zero, present address, civil status, and if married respondent, number of children, total household number (male/female), occupation, sources of income and monthly income. The second part will be the discussion on the experiences that highlight their perceived challenges in the implementation of the project, programs, and policies on transitional justice tools and mechanisms. The third/last part will be the recommendation for the implementation of programs, projects, and policies on transitional justice. The tools, both the interview guide and survey questionnaire, were pre-tested by the researcher with some respondents for validity and clarity. Focus Group Discussion (FGD) was also conducted in each area in deepening the discussion on the experience of the respondents and their challenges and recommendations for the implementation of transitional justice and sustainable peace in Lanao del Sur. FGD themes are the scope of TJ, such as legitimate grievances, human rights violations, essentials to promote healing and reconciliation, and recommendations for the recovery and rehabilitation of Marawi and transitional justice towards sustainable peace in Lanao del Sur.

### **3.4. Study Informants and Sampling Methods**

The researcher made use of snowball and purposive sampling in the selection of the respondents for the study. Snowball sampling is a non-probability sampling method that helps the researcher identify the respondents of the study. (Simkus,2022). The respondents were internally displaced persons and families living in the temporary shelter of Sagonsongan and Boganga, Marawi City, key persons of the Marawi recovery and rehabilitation plan of Marawi City, and experts of TJ in Lanao del Sur and the BARMM region. The respondents of this study were composed of 12 key informants, 13 FGD participants, and 97 respondents for the survey questionnaire. Two FGDs were conducted. First is are mixed group of IDPs in Boganga shelter with 7 participants, followed by another mixed group of IDPs in Sagonsongan shelter with 6 participants. A total of one hundred twenty-two (122) respondents (31 male, 90 female) participated in the study.

### 3.5. Data Analysis

In this study, the following statistical tools were used to analyze the data gathered with the help of a Social Statistician in the data analysis. The basic features of data in the study were described through the measures of frequency, specifically percent and frequency. Also, it used the Descriptive Statistics of the measures of central tendency, mean, and mode, and measures of variability, standard deviation.

In the FGD and KII, the data obtained were analyzed using Content Analysis. Content analysis is a structured analysis of words that examines words, patterns, repetition, and relationships (Vaismoradi, 2013). It uses a descriptive approach in both coding of the data and its interpretation of quantitative counts of the codes. (Morgan, 1993) The analyzed data are presented with themes.

### 3.6. Ethical Consideration

Consent form was discussed with the respondents during the KII and FGD. It was used to obtain the full consent of the respondents of the study. In the distribution of the survey questionnaire, the consent form was attached to be signed by the respondents and a signed letter by the researcher explaining the purpose of the study and ensure respect, anonymity, and utmost confidentiality. The instruments retrieved and documentation were stored by the researcher in a safety box, while the research data generated was stored electronically. The researcher has only accessed it. In the recoding of the data, a code number known only to the researcher was assigned to each participant instead of the participant's real name in a study to protect the identity of the respondents. The researcher discussed combined findings, and not individual-level data. This is to ensure respect, confidentiality, and anonymity in the study.

## 4. Results and Discussion

The presentation of results and discussion followed the research conceptual framework of the study.

### 4.1.1 Respondents' Age

The age of the respondents is between 18 to 80 years old, with a mean of 41.98 and SD 11.79. The level of adulthood of the respondents is pre-adult to late adulthood. The study shows that the majority of the respondents, 82 or 67.7 %, are middle-aged adults. Only a small minority of them are late adults, about 6 or 5%, early adults are 31 or 25.6 %, and pre-adults are 1 or 0.8 %. Thus, describes that the majority of the respondents are middle-aged adults between 36 to 55 years old.

### 4.1.2 Respondents' Number of Children

A fifth of them (21.5%) have two female children. Roughly one in ten has three female children. A few have four (6.6%) or five female children (4.1%). More than two-fifths (42.1%) do not have male children. Respondents with one male child constitute 16.5% of the distribution. Fourteen % have two male children, 13.2% have four, and 11.6% have three. A minority of the respondents have five (1.7%) and nine (0.8%) male children. Slightly more than three out of ten (30.6%) have no children. 14 % have at least two children. One in ten has three children. Very few of them have nine children (4.1%). On average, the respondents have two female children ( $M=1.52$ ;  $SD=1.67$ ) and one male child ( $M=1.48$ ;  $SD=1.67$ ). Therefore, the respondents have three children ( $M=3.02$ ;  $SD=2.90$ ). It shows that respondents of the study belong to a small household size composed of less than six members.

### 4.1.3. Respondents' Sex, Civil Status, Educational Attainment, and Occupation

As shown in Table 3 large percentage of the respondents are females. More than seven out of ten are females, 90 or 74.4%. A large portion of them is married, about 85 or 70.3 %. A minority are single, 13 or 10.7 % of the total respondents, divorced, with 12 or 9.9 %, and widowed, with about 10 or 8.3.% % of the total number of respondents. One respondent is separated. 37 or 30.6 % are college graduates, 24, or



19.8% are college level, 15, or 12.4 % are high school level, and 9, or 7.4 % are master level. Nearly half of the respondents, 47.1%, are unemployed/jobless. Slightly over a quarter of them, 25.6%, are public employees. 19 % are self-employed and 8.3% are private employees. The respondents are mostly female, married, and unemployed despite their high educational attainment as college graduates.

#### **4.1.4.Respondents' Sources of Income**

More than a third 35.5 % of the respondents rely on salaries as their main source of income, followed by 29.8% who received an allowance from family and relatives, 15.7% have businesses that generate income, and 12.4% have wages. A small percentage of them (4.1%) received subsidies from the government. Only 2 (0.8%) of the respondents have no source of income. Most of them (82.6%) do not have a second source of income. Over one in ten (11.6%) indicated business profits as their second source of income. A small fraction received an allowance from family or relatives (3.3.% %) and a subsidy from the government (2.5%). Thus, a large portion (82.6%) has one source of income only, while some (17.4%) have two sources of income. The number of unemployed respondents approximately corresponds to the percentage of respondents receiving allowance from family and not salaries. It shows that families that do not have income receive allowance from relatives as their source of income

#### **4.1.5.Respondents' Socioeconomic Classes**

Majority of the respondents belong to the low-income (65.3%) to poor (65.3%) socioeconomic classes. The low-income class includes the cluster of the poor with a monthly family income of P9,100 to P18,200 pesos. A minority of them (14.9%) are in the lower middle-income class. The lower middle class earns a family monthly income of 18,200 to 36,400 pesos. A very few (5.0%) are in the middle-income class. The middle-middle-income class earns a monthly family income of 36,400 to 63,400 pesos. Only one respondent belongs to the upper middle-income and one to the rich class. The upper middle class and rich class earn a family monthly income of 63,700 to 182,000 pesos. The average income of the respondents is 4,500 pesos, which is far below the poverty threshold in the Philippines of about 12,030 pesos per month for a family of five. (PSA, 2022). Therefore, the majority of the respondents belong to low-income and poor families.

#### **4.1.6. Respondents' Monthly Income**

The monthly income of the respondents shows that the majority of the respondents (62.8%) have a monthly income of Php 1,000 to Php 10,000. One in ten (11.6%) has a monthly salary that ranges from Php 20,001 to Php 30,000. A small proportion earn Php 40,001 to Php 50,000 (2.5%) and Php 60,00 and above (4.1%). Only one of the respondents has a 50,001 to 60,000 income range. Eight respondents did not indicate their monthly income. The average monthly income of the respondents is Php 4,500. This explains the findings in Table 4 that the majority of the respondents belong to low-income families and of poor socioeconomic status.

#### **4.1.7. Respondents' Home and Present Address**

The respondents are residents of the 24 Most Affected Areas (MAA) of Marawi City, or known as Ground Zero. The present address of the majority of the respondents is at the Least Affected Areas (LAA) barangays of Marawi, municipalities in Lanao del Sur and Lanao del Norte. The majority of the respondents are in the Sagonsongan shelter and Boganga Shelter located in the LAA of Marawi City. The two shelters are the biggest transitional homes for Marawi IDPs. The shelters are part of the rehabilitation program of the city. (Sarmiento, 2017). Boganga or the Lake View shelter is the second temporary relocation site for the Marawi IDP. There are 550 units of transitory shelters in Boganga. While Bahay ng Pagbabago in Barangay Sagonsongan has 1,052 temporary shelters. (Suson, 2019)

#### 4.2. Processes and Mechanisms of Transitional Justice

Transitional justice has four complementary pillars that are mutually reinforcing: the victims' right to truth, justice, reparation, and guarantees from the non-recurrence of violations. (SIDA. Transitional Justice. 2018). In the Philippines, there are transitional justice initiatives in truth, justice, reparations, and institutional reform. There is the Human Rights Victims' Claims Board (HRVCD) in 2013 that provided reparations to victims of the Marcos-era martial law violations. With the Bangsamoro conflict, is transitional justice and reconciliation commission (TJRC) was created (Embassy, 2018) For the Marawi Siege conflict, the Bangsamoro Autonomous Region Muslim Mindanao (BARMM) has the Marawi Rehabilitation Program 2020 on its website. These programs are implemented by the various agencies of BARMM such as the Ministry of Social Services and Development, Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries Aquatic Resources (MAFAR), Ministry of Human Settlement and Development (MHSD), Bangsamoro Human Rights Commission (BHRC) and Project Management Office (PMO) composing of the Deputy Chief Minister, Minister Hamid Barra, Senior Minister Abdulraof Macacua, Cabinet Secretary Pendatun, MP Abdullah Macapaar, MP Anna Tarhata Basman as program manager and MP Marjanie Mimbantas as a spokesperson. The program includes Bangsamoro Sagip Kabuhayan Program, Data Profiling of IDPs, Bangsamoro Assistance for Marawi IDPs excluded in the kathanor list, Land Acquisition and Land Development of Bangsamoro Bahay Program, 200 Resettlement Housing Project, Marawi City Microfinance for IDPs Farmers engaged in Agricultural farming, mobile healthcare project, one lake ambulance, One Lake Cadaver Transfer, Two Mobile Health clinics, water, sanitation and hygiene project, water rationing component, desludging services Component, 8,000L water truck, Installation of new water systems, Bangsamoro Sagip Kabuhayan Program, Bangsamoro's Assistance for Marawi IDPs excluded from the Kathanor List, Food production through urban gardening, Bangsamoro Bagsakan Station, Accounting of the dead and the missing and providing relevant support and services, Building permit assistance and construction of wash stations inside the MAA, Construction materials assistance with labor cost and subsidy training cost, Construction of the three-storey learning center with multi-purpose hall and court. These programs are a part of transitional justice in the reparation or rehabilitation of the Marawi Rehabilitation (MRP) of BARMM.

#### 4.3. Significant IDP Support received from the government and non-government organizations

The majority of the respondents, almost two-thirds or 65.29% of the respondents, were provided with shelter by the government. More than two-fifths (43.80%) received livelihood capital, while nearly a third (32.23%) underwent training and seminars. Thirty-six % received cash assistance, and 10.74% were given psychological first aid. A minority noted receiving groceries (0.83%) and food packs (1.65%). One respondent noted that she received some assistance for her PWD son. Since the majority of the respondents are from the temporary shelter majority of the respondents received support from the temporary shelter. On average, the respondents received at least two significant supports.

#### 5. Summary

Transitional Justice (TJ) is an attempt to build sustainable peace after conflict, mass violence, or systemic human rights abuse, and is recognized in Sustainable Development Goal 2030. TJ is linked to the Presidential Commission on Good Governance (PCHR), the Human Rights Victims Reparations and Recognition Act (RA 10368), and the Comprehensive Agreement in the Bangsamoro (CAB). CAB provides the basis for political authority, advances a chance to end violence, upholds the Bangsamoro's basic right to self-governance and self-management of Bangsamoro patrimony, and opens the possibility

towards reconciliation and correction of historical injustices. This study describes transitional justice in the context of post-conflict in Marawi. It was anchored on the Dealing with the Past (DwP) model, which is used by the Transitional Justice Reconciliation Commission (TJRC). The study examined the processes and mechanisms of transitional justice. The study used mixed methods of quantitative and qualitative data gathering to describe transitional justice mechanisms. The interview guide and survey questionnaire were pre-tested for validity and clarity. This study is conducted in Marawi City, known as Dansalan. It is a component city capital in the coastal province of Lanao del Sur. There were 100,000 civilians displaced by the five-month conflict in 2017 in Marawi City and still unable to return because of the extent of the damage, and still in temporary shelters or living with relatives elsewhere. (tt). The researcher conducted interviews and focus group discussions with area leaders and key persons on transitional justice, and used descriptive statistics. As a result of the study, the following are the major findings: Majority of the respondents are middle-aged adults. The majority of the respondents are females, married with educational attainment however nearly of the respondents are unemployed and jobless. They belong to the low-income to poor socioeconomic classes with an average monthly income of Php 4,500. The respondents were from the 24 barangays of Ground Zero in Marawi City. The Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) affected by the Marawi siege received support, including shelter, cash assistance, training, psychological first aid, and food packs or groceries, from the government, private individuals, and non-governmental organizations. Mapping the TJ Key players can also help in strategizing and understanding TJ.

## References

1. Ateneno de Manila. Duterte Reader: Critical Essay on Rodrigo's Early Presidency. (2018). *Ateneo de Manila University Press*.
2. Amnesty International (2008). Shattered Peace in Mindanao. The Human Cost of Conflict in Mindanao. Available: <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/>
3. Arthur, P. (2009). How Transition Reshaped Human Rights: A Conceptual History of Transitional Justice. *Human Rights Quarterly*. <https://doi.org/10.1353/hrq.0.0069>
4. Balint, J., Evans, J., & McMillan, N. (2014). Rethinking Transitional Justice, Redressing Indigenous Harm: A New Conceptual Approach. *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 8(2), 194-216. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://academic.oup.com/ijtj/article/8/2/194/2912075>
5. Brankovic, J., & Van de Merwe (2014). Transitional Justice in Post Conflict Societies: Conceptual Foundations and Debate. In V. Betita, M. Domes, D. Jaeger, L. Kirch, (pp 10 -15). Davao City: forumZFD Philippines.
6. Cassese. (2011). Reflections on International Criminal Justice. . *Journal of International Criminal Justice*.
7. Disney, A., & Gbowee, L. (2012). Gender and Sustainable Peace. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from [https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-1-4614-3555-6\\_10](https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-1-4614-3555-6_10)
8. Duthie, R. (2011). Transitional Justice and Displacement. *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 5(2), 241-261. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://academic.oup.com/ijtj/article/5/2/241/2357033>
9. Duggan, C. (2010). Editorial Note *International Journal of Transitional Justice*
10. Framework Agreement (2012). Framework on the Bangsamoro. Available: <http://pcdspo.gov.ph/downloads/2012/10/GPH-MILF-Framework-of-Agreement>.
11. Galace, L. a. (2008). *Peace Education: A Pathway to a Culture of Peace*. Quezon City, Philippines : Center for Peace Education, Miriam College.

12. Galchinsky, M. (2014). Lament as Transitional Justice. *Human Rights Review*, 15(3), 259-281. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from [https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1021&context=english\\_facpub](https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1021&context=english_facpub)
13. Galthung, J.(2009).Peace,Conflict and Violence in Hintjen,H. and Zarkov. 2015
14. Gale, N., Heath, G., Cameron, E., Rashid, S. F., & Redwood, S. (2013). Using the framework method for the analysis of qualitative data in multi-disciplinary health research. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 13(1), 117-117. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://bmcmmedresmethodol.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/1471-2288-13-117>
15. Gates, S., Binningsbø, H. M., & Lie, T. G. (2007). Post-Conflict Justice and Sustainable Peace. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from [https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=979663](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=979663)
16. Goldman, R. M., & Nikolov, S. E. (2008). Political Systems and Conflict Management. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/B9780123739858001380>
17. Greiff, P. *Transitional Justice, Security, and Development Security and Justice Thematic Paper*. World Bank.2010
18. Gurr, T. *Why Men Rebel*. Princeton University Press.1970
19. Lambourne, W. (2008). Transitional Justice and Peacebuilding after Mass Violence. *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 3(1), 28-48. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://academic.oup.com/ijtj/article-abstract/3/1/28/2356956>
20. Laplante, L. J., & Phenicie, K. (2009). Mediating Post-Conflict Dialogue: The Media's Role in Transitional Justice Processes. *Marquette Law Review*, 93(1), 251. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://scholarship.law.marquette.edu/facpub/42>
21. Leederach,J.P (2005).On Peace Accords:Image of a Line Time,The Moral Imagination: The Art and Soul of Building Peace.June 201, 2014.
22. Maglana,M.(2019).Transitional Justice-Dealing with the Past: An Overview.Davao City.
23. Malicdem. (2017). *Post-war Status of Structures at the Main Battle Area of the Marawi Siege*.
24. Mattel, C. (2008). John Paul Lederach; The Little Book of Conflict Transformation. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://elibrary.verlagoesterreich.at/article/99.105005/pm200804022201>
25. Moser, C., & Clark, F. C. (2001). Gender, conflict, and building sustainable peace: Recent lessons from Latin America. *Gender & Development*, 9(3), 29-39. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/13552070127755>
26. Oledan, S. a. (2019). *Transitional Justice and Reconciliation in and Beyond the Bangsamoro*. Davao City: Initiatives for International Dialogue.
27. Onwuegbuzie, A. J., Leech, N. L., & Collins, K. M. (2010). Innovative Data Collection Strategies in Qualitative Research. *The Qualitative Report*, 15(3), 696-726. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol15/iss3/12>
28. Plantilla,J.(1997).Elusive Promises: Transitional Justice in the Philippines>Human Rights Dialogue.
29. Powers, K. a. (2016). *Victim 's Justice in the Aftermath of Political Violence: Why Do Countries Award Reparation. Foreign Policy Analysis* .
30. *Research Study on Community Narratives of Resilience and Truth Seeking*. 2019
31. Reyes, D. (2017). *Thousand of Marawi Evacuees Return Home*. Retrieved from <http://www.manilatimes.net/thousands-marawi-evacuees-return-home//359556>
32. Rudolph, C. (n.d.). *Constructing an Atrocity Regime: The Politics of War Crimes Tribunals*. 2001.
33. Report of the Transitional Justice and Reconciliation Commission. (2016).Makati City.

34. Richmond, O. (2011). *A Post-Liberal Peace*. Routledge. Retrieved 6 2, 2022
35. Santiso, C. (2002). Promoting Democratic Governance and Preventing the Recurrence of Conflict: The Role of the United Nations Development Programme in Post-Conflict Peace-Building. *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 34(03), 555-586. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from [http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract\\_s0022216x02006508](http://journals.cambridge.org/abstract_s0022216x02006508)
36. Simkus, J. (2022, Jan 10). *Snowball Sampling: Definition, Method, and Examples*.
37. Simply Psychology. [www.simplypsychology.org/snowball-sampling.html](http://www.simplypsychology.org/snowball-sampling.html)
38. Taylor, S. (1998). *Coping Strategies*. Retrieved from Retrieved from <https://www.macses.ucsf.edu/research/psychocial/coping.php>.
39. Transitional Justice and Reconciliation in and Beyond the Bangsamoro. (2019). In I. f. Dialogue. Davao City, Philippines.
40. *Timeline of the Bangsamoro PEace Process and Cso Engagements of the Bangsamoro Organic Law*. 2020
41. Tiethel, R. G (2000). Introduction. In *Transitional Justice*. New York. Oxford University Press. Retrieved from [http://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac\\_books](http://digitalcommons.nyls.edu/fac_books)
42. *TJRC Report. 2016*
43. TJRC Land Report 2017: Dealing with the Past and Land Dispossession in the Bangsamoro. (2017). Cotabato City and Manila.
44. UN (2010). United Nations approach to transitional Justice. Guidance Note of the Secretary-General.
45. UN Women (2018) *Transitional Justice and Peace Negotiations with a gender lens*.
46. United Nations, U. (2010). *Guidance Note of the Secretary General: United Nation Approach to Transitional Justice*.
47. United Nations, U. (2015). *United Nations General Assembly. Transforming our world: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Preamble*.
48. United Nations, U. (April 2016). *United Nations General Assembly Resolution 70/262*.
49. Winter, S. (2013). Towards a Unified Theory of Transitional Justice. *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, 7(2), 224-244. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://academic.oup.com/ijtj/article/7/2/224/723004>
50. Wright, W. A. (2004). Book Review: *Building Peace: Sustainable Reconciliation in Divided Societies: Armed Forces & Society*, 30(3), 491-495. Retrieved 6 2, 2022, from <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0095327x0403000311>