Exploring Leadership Models in Education: Transformational, Transactional, and Situational Approaches

Fan Zitong[1], Zheng Yang[2], Zainudin Mohd Isa[3]

[1]Ph.D. Student, Department of Education and Liberal Sciences, City University Malaysia
[2]Department of Education and Liberal Sciences, City University Malaysia
[3]Lecturer, Department of Education and Liberal Sciences, City University Malaysia

Abstract
Different leadership theories were reviewed, and the focus was on the practical application and its significance in the educational field. The most effective leadership theories is identified after examined the different leadership styles and its impact on the school administration and educational outcome. Leaders are important in creating vision, change and progress within an organisation, especially in education where this will affect the teacher morale, student engagement and the institutional culture, this paper explores transformational, transactional and situational leadership theories and evaluate the relevance and effectiveness of managing the challenges in the educational institution such as policy changes, technological advancements and diverse student needs. By integrating these leadership theories, this review aim to provide effective leadership qualities to enhance the educational leaders to better manage change, innovation and better educational outcomes.

Keywords: Leadership theories, Educational outcomes, Transformational leadership, Transactional leadership, situational leadership

Introduction
This is a review on different leadership theories, principles and styles available currently and it practicality and importance in the educational field. We look into how the differences in leadership influence the various outcome on school administration and most importantly educational outcomes. By this detailed analysis of different leadership models, we identified the most effective models and approaches suitable for the educational field.

Leadership has an important role in every organizational framework. To lead is to influence and is an art to motivate a group of people to a successful goal. Leaders are the catalyst for the vision, change and progress in the society. As leadership is important for a successful outcome in various field, this spun the interest in the study of different leadership models. The social, psychological and organizational factors were analysed to find out the most effective leadership theories. Different leaders are available; from the charisma of a powerful leader to the calculated precision of a transactional leadership, this complex interplay of different traits and behaviours among leaders are investigated to determine the effective style to apply in different organizational settings.

With the current trend of globalization and fast-paced society, its critical to have a good leader to maximise the organization's potential to succeed. There will be always unprecedented challenges and changes, necessitating leaders to not only adept at managing the present, but also have vision to anticipate and guiding towards the future. We delved into the importance of different qualities of leaders and how it can be cultivated for different challenges.

There remains significant gap in application of leadership theories, principles and styles in the educational field as evidence by the limited assimilation of existing leadership theories by the educational leaders. There is a lack of comprehensive understanding among the leaders as to which leadership styles is effective for a very diverse educational field, leading to inconsistencies in the leadership practices and thus affecting the efficacy of their management and their ability to achieve educational goals. With increasing educational demands, technological advancements and society expectations, the educational field is facing more and more challenges, and its leaders may not be equipped with the adaptive leadership qualities needed for a successful outcome. This paper seeks to bridge the theoretical leadership models available with practical application for the educational leaders, by the analysis of different leadership theories, principles and styles suitable in the educational settings.

By incorporating different theoretical leadership models to the real-world applications , we aim to provide strategies to nurture and develop effective leadership qualities especially in the ever- changing educational field. In conclusion, the impact of leadership theories, principles, and styles on the development and professional practice of educational leaders are analysis in this paper. The importances of continuous training, mentorship, and reflective practice in nurturing leaders in the education sector, enable them to better equip to manage change, be more innovative, and ensuring positive outcomes for all involved in the educational field.

Research Objectives

The research objective of this paper is to explore the differences in various leadership theories including transformational, transactional and situational leadership model. Different leadership styles were analysed and determined the applicability of it in the educational settings particularly in administration efficacy, student results outcomes and the satisfaction of the teacher. We also assess the adaptability of leadership theories in facing the different challenges by educational leaders, such as policy changes, advancement in the technology and diverse educational needs.

2.   Literature Review

Review of articles

Leadership is a quality to sought after in almost all the occupational field nowadays. It should not be confused with management as it traditionally focus on activities of staffing, organizing, controlling and planning; and leadership is emphasized in the influences process. (1)Management is about order and stability and leadership is about adaptation and constructive changes. (2,3) A good leader is able to carry out his leadership to realize the vison and mission of the institution.

In the context of education, it is important in building and shaping a good learning environment, influencing and bringing overall success to the educational institutions. Many studies had been performed to determine the effect of leadership and school performances.(4–6) Outcome of the students are shown to be affected by the school leadership. (i.e student attendance rate, achievement, further studies rate)(7) It is a more complex environment for higher education institutions as it is a different environment that

include external factors influence, new technologies for teaching, globalization and changing student demographics. (8)

We reviewed key leadership theories including transformational, transactional and situational leadership theories and evaluated the relevance and effectiveness of them in the educational world. By this review, we want to better understand the theories and its practical implications, to allow our educational leaders to adopt this strategies and changes to implement positive changes and improve educational outcomes. This is important as the leadership style among the school leaders do play a significant role on the teacher wellbeing and motivation. (9) Leadership in education system is also different from other field as this is based on mainly relationship with individuals and this will encourage the followers especially the teachers to better apply their expertise, abilities and efforts for the institution.(10)

Leadership Theories in Educational Management

1. Transformational Leadership

Transformational leadership, introduced by James Burns in his 1978 book of "Leadership" is defined as "leaders and their followers raise one another to higher levels of morality and motivation" and was further developed by Bernard Bass later in 1985.(11,12) These leaders are characterized by their ability to create a vision, effective communication among the team, motivating team to deliver the vision and create an environment of trust and teamwork for the education institutions. In education settings, this will lead to improved teacher morale, enhanced student engagement and a culture of continuous improvement. (13) Transformational leaders bring in motivations and trust among the stakeholders, works to bring teachers together to bring the institution forward while supporting creativity in local and global environment.(14)

2. Transactional Leadership

Transactional leadership is a style of leadership that focuses on the transactions between leaders and followers.(12) First describe by Max Weber in 1947, this is most often used by the managers and is also named Managerial leadership.(15) Leaders provide rewards or punishments based on performance and the main goal of the followers is to obey the instructions of the leader. While this is effective in upholding order and realizing short-term goal, the followers do not bring as much of commitment and innovations as transformational leadership. This however is useful in managing administrating tasks and ensuring compliance to procedures and policies in the educational settings. Transactional leaders also do have significant influence on learning motivation and student's academic performance based on this goal and reward system.(16) They are effective in setting clear goals, monitoring performance and providing necessary changes if needed. (17)

3. Situational Leadership

Situational Leadership is a flexible structure that allows the leaders to create approaches that suits to the need and maturity level of the team or individual members. This model allow the institution to realize maximum goals with the available resources. First developed by Paul Hersey in 1979, the leaders must be able change their style to the needs of the team and situation on hand. (18) This leadership theories will be useful in education settings as it allowed the leaders to be flexible and responsive to the needs of teachers, students and communities as globalization nowadays brought stakeholders of multiracial and multiculture to the education institutions. (19) This flexibility will allow better approaches to the unique challenges and opportunities faced by the institutions. Leaders with situational leadership can respond more effectively to different challenges such as changes in educational policy, technological advancements and diverse student needs.(16)

Evaluating Leadership Styles in Educational Management

1. Transformational Leadership in Education

Transformational leadership had been widely accepted in the educational institutions with research showing its positive impact on the student overall achievement, teacher's work satisfaction and the institution culture. (20). Leaders with transformational style inspired and motivated the staff to provide better learning environment, promote teachers professional development, and ultimately create an supportive and inclusive learning ecosystem for the students to excel in.(21) Hallinger showed transformational principles do create a collaborative and empowering environment to encourage teachers to be more innovative and willingly engage in continuous improvement.(22) By focusing on vision, collaboration, innovation and empowerment, educational institutions will have meaningful and sustainable improvements; and provide a comprehensive framework for a lasting and positive impact.(23) Having a vision also do help provide personal goals for the teachers and will motivate and inspire them to sacrifice some of their own interest for the sake of the institution. This however is based on a vision that reflect the needs and interest of the school community and connected to reality and is attainable goals.(10)

2. Transactional Leadership in Education

Transactional leadership may not be readily accepted as transformational style, but it still plays a critical role in educational field. A transactional leaders will ensure that the policies are followed, efficiently allocated available resources and meeting the organizational goals and key performing indicators of the followers.(17) This is important in maintaining the structure and accountability of the education ecosystem.(24) This will be useful in scenarios in which specific outcomes are needed and adhering to the rules and procedures is greatly needed. (9) This is shown in the education field in the relationship between the instructor and students as the students are required to complete certain assignments, and if they performed well; they will be rewarded with good grades. (8) However, this style of leadership is only motivating on a base level and fails to motivate the followers who fails a set goal and do not improve the followers' development. (25)

3. Situational Leadership in Education

The flexibility in situational leadership makes it easier to be applied in the educational management. This is because the leaders can provide the needed support and direction after analysing the different needs of the staff and students. This will ensure the teachers to have the guidance to grow professionally and the students have the targeted support for academic success as more can flourish with individualized support system. Situational analysis and the identification of the teacher's different characteristic by the principle will allow the school to create a better platform for the students. (26) To lead the students to a better educational outcome; Meier had constructed a methodological orientation of teaching based on the situational model. (27)He proposed to introduce different method based on the maturity of the students and the student's need for direction and instruction is adjusted accordingly. Ultimately, this will produced students with have high maturity level and well developed skills. (27)

Adapting Leadership Theories to Educational Challenges

There are many challenges faced by the educational leaders and this include policy changes, changes of the teaching syllabus, technological advancement and the diverse student needs. Leadership theories are available to help to combat the problem more effectively. Transformational, transactional and situational leadership theories are chosen for this analysis because these theories comprehensively will be able to address the diverse needs of educational institutions. Transformational leaders can drive innovation and

create a positive educational environment, by emphasizing on vision, motivation and team cooperations. Transactional leaders ensure the management of the day-to-day operations and policy compliance with clear structures and accountability for an effective resources management. They also help with the compliances to the rules by the students. On the other hand, situational leaders can provide the flexibility needed to the changing circumstances and different individual needs, making it relevant in the ever changing education landscape. (28) Leaders that can integrate these leadership theories together is able to inspire and motivate the staffs and the students, maintaining order and be able to face new challenges. They are also able to face complex issues such as student diversity, teacher's burnout and the integration of technology for teaching. (29)

Conclusion

In conclusion, this paper highlights the impact of different leadership theories on the professional practice of the educational leaders. This review showed the importance of transformational, transactional and situational leadership theories in addressing the dynamic challenges of the educational institutions. Transformational leadership create a positive and innovative school culture, transactional leadership ensure efficient management and policy compliance and situational leadership create flexibility to better solve ever changing circumstances. This review demonstrated that for an educational leader to succeed, they will need comprehensive understanding of the different theories. Continuous training, mentorship and reflective practice are important for a leader who can drive positive changes and improve educational outcomes.

References

1. Hogan J, Hogan R, Kaiser RB. Management derailment. In: APA handbook of industrial and organizational psychology, Vol 3: Maintaining, expanding, and contracting the organization. Washington, DC, US: American Psychological Association; 2011. p. 555–75. (APA handbooks in psychology®.).
2. Arnett RC. Dialogic Education: Conversation About Ideas and Between Persons. Southern Illinois University Press; 1992.
3. Northouse PG. Leadership: Theory and Practice [Internet]. SAGE Publications; 2012. Available from: https://books.google.com.my/books?id=MIKDJx2YHSIC
4. Robinson V, Lloyd C, Rowe K. The Impact of Leadership on Student Outcomes: An Analysis of the Differential Effects of Leadership Types. http://lst-iiep.iiep-unesco.org/cgi-bin/wwwi32.exe/[in=epidoc1.in]/?t2000=026306/(100). 2008 Dec 1;44.
5. Supovitz J, Sirinides P, May H. How Principals and Peers Influence Teaching and Learning. Educ Adm Q - EDUC ADMIN QUART. 2010 Feb 1;46:31–56.
6. Witziers B, Bosker R, Kruger M. Educational Leadership and Student Achievement: The Elusive Search for an Association. http://lst-iiep.iiep-unesco.org/cgi-bin/wwwi32.exe/[in=epidoc1.in]/?t2000=018909/(100). 2003 Aug 1;39.
7. Leithwood K, Harris A, Hopkins D. Seven Strong Claims about Successful School Leadership. Sch Leadersh Manag. 2008 Feb 1;28:27–42.
8. Khan N. Adaptive or Transactional Leadership in Current Higher Education: A Brief Comparison. Int Rev Res Open Distrib Learn. 2017 May 12;18.
9. Eyal O, Roth G. Principals' leadership and teachers' motivation : Self-determination theory analysis.

J Educ Adm. 2011 May 1;49:256–75.

10. Barnett K, McCormick J. Vision, relationships and teacher motivation: A case study. J Educ Adm. 2003 Feb 1;41:55–73.

11. Burns JM. Leadership. Leadership. Oxford, England: Harper & Row; 1978. ix, 530–ix, 530.

12. Bass BM. Comment: Transformational Leadership: Looking at Other Possible Antecedents and Consequences. J Manag Inq [Internet]. 1995 Sep 1;4(3):293–7. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1177/105649269543010

13. Leithwood K, Jantzi D. The effects of transformational leadership on organizational conditions and student engagement with school. J Educ Adm. 2000 May 1;38:112–29.

14. Nuckols W, Howell J, Gregory D, Williams M, Bullington K. Howell, J. L., Bullington, K. E., Gregory, D. E., Williams, M. R., & Nuckols, W. L. (2022). Transformational leadership scores of doctoral higher educational programs. Journal of Higher Education Policy and Leadership Studies, 3(1), 51-66. 2022 Jun 1;

15. Weber 1864-1920 M. Max Weber, the theory of social and economic organization [Internet]. New York: Free Press; London: Collier Macmillan, [1947] ©1947; Available from: https://search.library.wisc.edu/catalog/999697724602121

16. Sika JO, Anyango PO. Transactional Leadership Style and Their Influence on the Learning Motivation and Student's Academic Performance in KCSE Examinations in Migori County, Kenya. Int J Innov Res Dev. 2020;9(6):124–9.
Bass B, Riggio R. Transformational leadership: Second edition. Transformational Leadership: Second Edition. 2005. 1–282 p.

17. Hersey P, Blanchard KH, Natemeyer WE. Situational Leadership, Perception, and the Impact of Power. Gr Organ Stud [Internet]. 1979 Dec 1;4(4):418–28. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1177/105960117900400404

18. Blanchard K, Zigarmi D, Nelson R. Situational Leadership(R) After 25 Years: A Retrospective. J Leadersh Organ Stud - J Lead Organ Stud. 1993 Nov 1;1:21–36.

19. Leithwood K, Jantzi D. A Review of Transformational School Leadership Research 1996–2005. Leadersh Policy Sch. 2005 Sep 1;4:177–99.

20. McLaughlin C, Kunk-Czaplicki J. Leadership: Theory and Practice by Peter G. Northouse. J Coll Stud Dev. 2020 Jan 1;61:260–1.

21. Hallinger P. Leading Educational Change: reflections on the practice of instructional and transformational leadership. Cambridge J Educ. 2003 Nov 1;33:329–52.

22. Pennell L. Transformational Leadership in Education: A Comprehensive Approach to Educational Success. 2023.

23. Marzano R, Waters T, McNulty B. School Leadership that Works: From Research to Results. Assoc Superv Curric Dev. 2005 Jan 1;

24. Dong B. A Systematic Review of the Transactional Leadership Literature and Future Outlook. Acad J Manag Soc Sci. 2023 May 3;2:21–5.

25. Maisyaroh M, Imron A, Burhanuddin S, Juharyanto J, Satria R, Puspitaningtyas I. Implementation of Situational Leadership in Educational Organizations. 2019.

26. Meier D. Situational Leadership Theory as a Foundation for a Blended Learning Framework. J Educ Pract. 2016 Jan 1;7:25–30.

27. Avolio BJ, Walumbwa FO, Weber TJ. Leadership: Current theories, research, and future directions.

Vol. 60, Annual Review of Psychology. Avolio, Bruce J.: Department of Management, University of Nebraska, Lincoln, NE, US, 68588-0491, bavolio2@unl.edu: Annual Reviews; 2009. p. 421–49.

28. Bush T, Glover D. School leadership models: What do we know? Sch Leadersh Manag. 2014 Nov 10;34:1–19.